Tidy proof systems for intuitionistic modal logic

Sonia Marin With Kaustuv Chaudhuri and Lutz Straßburger

Inria, LIX, École Polytechnique

June 16, 2016

Modular focused proof systems for intuitionistic modal logic

Sonia Marin With Kaustuv Chaudhuri and Lutz Straßburger

Inria, LIX, École Polytechnique

June 16, 2016

Modal logics:

program verification, artificial intelligence, distributed systems

Modal logics:

program verification, artificial intelligence, distributed systems

We want to study *automated* proof search for modal logics with a *proof-theoretically* justified approach.

Modal logics:

program verification, artificial intelligence, distributed systems

We want to study *automated* proof search for modal logics with a *proof-theoretically* justified approach.

Our specific desiderata:

- 1. structural proof systems (sequent style)
- 2. analytic (cut-free)
- 3. modular for a large class of modal logics
- 4. control of non-deterministic choices

Formulas: $A ::= a \mid A \land A \mid \top \mid A \lor A \mid \bot \mid A \rightarrow A$

Logic IK: Intuitionistic Propositional Logic

Formulas: $A ::= a \mid A \land A \mid \top \mid A \lor A \mid \bot \mid A \rightarrow A \mid \Box A \mid \Diamond A$

Logic IK: Intuitionistic Propositional Logic + Axioms

Formulas: $A ::= a \mid A \land A \mid \top \mid A \lor A \mid \bot \mid A \rightarrow A \mid \Box A \mid \Diamond A$

Logic IK: Intuitionistic Propositional Logic + Axioms

Kripke semantics: (Bi)relational structures

Formulas: $A ::= a \mid A \land A \mid \top \mid A \lor A \mid \bot \mid A \rightarrow A \mid \Box A \mid \Diamond A$

Logic IK: Intuitionistic Propositional Logic + Axioms

Kripke semantics: (Bi)relational structures



Sequent:

A, B, C

Nested sequent:

$$\begin{array}{c} A, B, C \\ \frown & \frown \\ D & D, A \\ \downarrow & \frown \\ B & C & E \end{array}$$

Nested sequent:



 $\Gamma = A, B, C, [D, [B]], [D, A, [C], [E]]$

Nested sequent:



 $\Gamma = A, B, C, [D, [B]], [D, A^{\circ}, [C], [E]]$

$$\begin{array}{c} A, B, C \\ & & \\ & & \\ B \\ & & \\ B \\ & & \\$$

 ${\sf F}\{\ \}={\sf A},{\sf B},{\sf C},[\{\ \},[{\sf B}]],[{\sf D},{\sf A}^\circ,[{\sf C}],[{\sf E}]]$



 $\Gamma\{C, [E]\} = A, B, C, [C, [E], [B]], [D, A^{\circ}, [C], [E]]$

$$\begin{array}{c} A, B, C \\ & & \\ & & \\ B \\ & & \\ B \\ & & \\$$

 $\label{eq:general} {\sf F}\{\ \} = {\sf A}, {\sf B}, {\sf C}, [\{\ \}, [{\sf B}]], [{\sf D}, {\sf A}^\circ, [{\sf C}], [{\sf E}]]$



 $\Gamma^*\{C, [E^\circ]\} = A, B, C, [C, [E^\circ], [B]], [D, [C], [E]]$

System NIK:

$$\begin{split} & \mathsf{id} \frac{\Gamma\{A^\circ\}}{\Gamma\{a,a^\circ\}} & \wedge_R \frac{\Gamma\{A^\circ\}}{\Gamma\{A \wedge B^\circ\}} & \wedge_L \frac{\Gamma\{A,B\}}{\Gamma\{A \wedge B\}} & \top_R \frac{\Gamma\{\Gamma^\circ\}}{\Gamma\{\Gamma^\circ\}} \\ & \vee_{R1} \frac{\Gamma\{A^\circ\}}{\Gamma\{A \vee B^\circ\}} & \vee_{R2} \frac{\Gamma\{B^\circ\}}{\Gamma\{A \vee B^\circ\}} & \vee_L \frac{\Gamma\{A\}}{\Gamma\{A \vee B\}} & \bot_L \frac{\Gamma\{L\}}{\Gamma\{L\}} \\ & \to_R \frac{\Gamma\{A,B^\circ\}}{\Gamma\{A \to B^\circ\}} & \to_L \frac{\Gamma^*\{A \to B,A^\circ\}}{\Gamma\{A \to B\}} & \Gamma\{B\} \\ & & \diamond_R \frac{\Gamma\{[A^\circ,\Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\diamond A\}} & \diamond_L \frac{\Gamma\{[A]\}}{\Gamma\{\diamond A\}} & \Box_R \frac{\Gamma\{[A^\circ]\}}{\Gamma\{\Box A^\circ\}} & \Box_L \frac{\Gamma\{[A,\Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\Box A,[\Delta]\}} \end{split}$$

Sequent-like rules:

$$\wedge_{R} \frac{\Gamma \vdash A \quad \Gamma \vdash B}{\Gamma \vdash A \land B} \quad \rightsquigarrow \quad \wedge_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{A^{\circ}\} \quad \Gamma\{B^{\circ}\}}{\Gamma\{A \land B^{\circ}\}} \\ \wedge_{L} \frac{\Gamma, A, B \vdash C}{\Gamma, A \land B \vdash C} \quad \rightsquigarrow \quad \wedge_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{A, B\}}{\Gamma\{A \land B\}}$$

Sequent-like rules:

$$\wedge_{R} \frac{\Gamma \vdash A \quad \Gamma \vdash B}{\Gamma \vdash A \wedge B} \quad \rightsquigarrow \quad \wedge_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{A^{\circ}\} \quad \Gamma\{B^{\circ}\}}{\Gamma\{A \wedge B^{\circ}\}} \\ \wedge_{L} \frac{\Gamma, A, B \vdash C}{\Gamma, A \wedge B \vdash C} \quad \rightsquigarrow \quad \wedge_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{A, B\}}{\Gamma\{A \wedge B\}}$$

Nested rules:

$$\Box_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{[A^{\circ}]\}}{\Gamma\{\Box A^{\circ}\}} \qquad \Box_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{[A, \Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\Box A, [\Delta]\}}$$

Completeness: each modal theorem has a proof in NIK

Completeness: each modal theorem has a proof in NIK

Analyticity: the cut-rule

$$\frac{\Gamma\{A\} \quad \Gamma^*\{A^\circ\}}{\Gamma\{\emptyset\}} \quad \text{is admissible}$$

Completeness: each modal theorem has a proof in NIK

Analyticity: the cut-rule
$$\frac{\Gamma\{A\} \ \Gamma^*\{A^\circ\}}{\Gamma\{\emptyset\}}$$
 is admissible

Modularity: each axiom becomes a rule

Modal rules:

$$d_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{[A^{\circ}]\}}{\Gamma\{\diamond A^{\circ}\}} = t_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{A^{\circ}\}}{\Gamma\{\diamond A^{\circ}\}} = b_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{[\Delta], A^{\circ}\}}{\Gamma\{[\Delta, \diamond A^{\circ}]\}} = 4_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{[\diamond A^{\circ}, \Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\diamond A^{\circ}, [\Delta]\}} = 5_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{\emptyset\}\{\diamond A^{\circ}\}}{\Gamma\{\diamond A^{\circ}\}\{\emptyset\}}$$
$$d_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{[A]\}}{\Gamma\{\Box A\}} = t_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{A\}}{\Gamma\{\Box A\}} = b_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{[\Delta], A\}}{\Gamma\{[\Delta, \diamond A^{\circ}]\}} = 4_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{[\Box A, \Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\Box A, [\Delta]\}\}} = 5_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{\emptyset\}\{\Box A\}}{\Gamma\{\Box A\}\{\emptyset\}}$$
$$d: \Box A \to \Diamond A = t: A \to \diamond A = b: A \to \Box \diamond A = A = A = b: A \to \Box \diamond A = b: A \to \Box \bullet \bullet A = b: A \to \Box \bullet \bullet \bullet A = b: A \to \Box \bullet A = b: A \to \Box \bullet A = b: A \to \Box \bullet \bullet A = b: A \to \Box \bullet A = b: A \to \Box \bullet \bullet A = b: A \to \Box \bullet \bullet A = b: A \to \Box \bullet A = b: A \to \Box \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet A = b: A \to \Box$$











 Polarities:
 non-invertible right rules :
 positive connectives negative connectives

 non-invertible left rules :
 negative connectives

Polarities: non-invertible right rules : positive connectives non-invertible left rules : negative connectives

Formulas: $A ::= a \mid A \land A \mid \top \mid A \lor A \mid \bot \mid A \rightarrow A \mid \Box A \mid \Diamond A$

Polarities:non-invertible right rules:positive connectivesnon-invertible left rules:negative connectivesPolarized formulas:P, Q::= $p \mid Q \land P \mid \top \mid P \lor Q \mid \bot$ N::= $n \mid P \rightarrow N$



Polarities:non-invertible right rules:positive connectivesnon-invertible left rules:negative connectivesPolarized formulas:P, Q::= $p \mid Q \land P \mid \top \mid P \lor Q \mid \bot \mid \diamond P \mid \downarrow N$ N::= $n \mid P \rightarrow N \mid \Box N \mid \uparrow P$

Two kind of sequents:

 $\begin{array}{ll} & \Gamma\{A\} & \text{ordinary} \\ & \Gamma\{\langle N\rangle\} & \text{left-focused} & & \Gamma\{\langle P\rangle\} & \text{right-focused} \end{array}$

Two kind of sequents:

 $\Gamma\{A\}$ ordinary $\Gamma\{\langle N \rangle\}$ left-focused $\Gamma\{\langle P \rangle\}$ right-focused

System NIK:



Two kind of sequents:

 $\Gamma\{A\}$ ordinary $\Gamma\{\langle N \rangle\}$ left-focused $\Gamma\{\langle P \rangle\}$ right-focused

System NIK:



Two kind of sequents:

 $\Gamma\{A\}$ ordinary $\Gamma\{\langle N \rangle\}$ left-focused $\Gamma\{\langle P \rangle\}$ right-focused

Focused system FoNIK:



Two kind of sequents:

 $\Gamma\{A\}$ ordinary $\Gamma\{\langle N \rangle\}$ left-focused $\Gamma\{\langle P \rangle\}$ right-focused

Focused system FoNIK:

	$\uparrow_R \frac{\Gamma\{\uparrow P, \langle P \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\uparrow P\}}$	$\downarrow_L \frac{\Gamma\{\downarrow N, \langle N \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\downarrow N\}}$	
$\wedge_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{\langle P \rangle\} \Gamma\{\langle Q \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\langle P \land Q \rangle\}}$	$\wedge_L \frac{\Gamma\{P,Q\}}{\Gamma\{P\wedge Q\}}$	$\top_{R} \frac{1}{\Gamma\{\langle \top \rangle\}}$	$\top_L \frac{\Gamma\{\emptyset\}}{\Gamma\{\top\}}$
$\vee_{R1} \frac{ \Gamma\{\langle P \rangle\} }{ \Gamma\{\langle P \lor Q \rangle\} }$	$\vee_{R2} \frac{\Gamma\{\langle Q \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\langle P \lor Q \rangle\}}$	$\vee_L \frac{\Gamma\{P\} \Gamma\{Q\}}{\Gamma\{P \lor Q\}}$	$\perp_L \overline{\Gamma\{\perp\}}$
$id_{R} \ \overline{\Gamma\{p,\langle p \rangle\}}$	$id_L {\Gamma\{n, \langle n \rangle\}}$	$\to_R \frac{\Gamma\{P,N\}}{\Gamma\{P\to N\}}$	$\rightarrow_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{\langle P \rangle\} \Gamma\{\langle N \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\langle P \rightarrow N \rangle\}}$
$\diamond_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{[\langle P \rangle, \Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \diamond P \rangle, [\Delta]\}}$	$\diamond_L \frac{\Gamma\{[P]\}}{\Gamma\{\diamond P\}}$	$\Box_R \frac{\Gamma\{[N]\}}{\Gamma\{\Box N\}}$	$\Box_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{[\langle N \rangle, \Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \Box N \rangle, [\Delta]\}}$

Two kind of sequents:

 $\Gamma\{A\}$ ordinary $\Gamma\{\langle N \rangle\}$ left-focused $\Gamma\{\langle P \rangle\}$ right-focused

Focused system FoNIK:

$\uparrow_L \frac{\Gamma\{P\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \uparrow P \rangle\}}$	$\uparrow_R \frac{\Gamma\{\uparrow P, \langle P \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\uparrow P\}}$	$\downarrow_L \frac{F\{\downarrow N, \langle N \rangle\}}{F\{\downarrow N\}}$	$\downarrow_{R} \frac{\Gamma^{*}\{N\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \downarrow N\rangle\}}$
$\wedge_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{\langle P \rangle\} \Gamma\{\langle Q \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\langle P \land Q \rangle\}}$	$\wedge_L \frac{\Gamma\{P,Q\}}{\Gamma\{P\wedge Q\}}$	$\top_{R} \frac{1}{\Gamma\{\langle \top \rangle\}}$	$\top_L \frac{\Gamma\{\emptyset\}}{\Gamma\{\top\}}$
$\vee_{R1} \frac{\Gamma\{\langle P \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\langle P \lor Q \rangle\}}$	$\vee_{R2} \frac{\Gamma\{\langle Q \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\langle P \lor Q \rangle\}}$	$\vee_L \frac{ \Gamma\{P\} \Gamma\{Q\} }{ \Gamma\{P \lor Q\} }$	$\perp_L \overline{\Gamma\{\perp\}}$
$id_{R} {\Gamma\{p,\langle p \rangle\}}$	$\operatorname{id}_{L} \overline{\Gamma\{n, \langle n \rangle\}}$	$\to_R \frac{\Gamma\{P,N\}}{\Gamma\{P\to N\}}$	$\rightarrow_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{\langle P \rangle\} \Gamma\{\langle N \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\langle P \rightarrow N \rangle\}}$
$\diamond_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{[\langle P \rangle, \Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \diamond P \rangle, [\Delta]\}}$	$\diamond_L \frac{\Gamma\{[P]\}}{\Gamma\{\diamond P\}}$	$\square_R \frac{\Gamma\{[N]\}}{\Gamma\{\square N\}}$	$\Box_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{[\langle N \rangle, \Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \Box N \rangle, [\Delta]\}}$

Modal rules:

$d_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{[A^\circ]\}}{\Gamma\{\diamondsuit{A}^\circ\}}$	$t_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{A^{\circ}\}}{\Gamma\{\diamondsuit A^{\circ}\}}$	$b_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{[\Delta], A^{\circ}\}}{\Gamma\{[\Delta, \diamondsuit A^{\circ}]\}}$	$4_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{[\diamondsuit{A^{\circ}}, \Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\diamondsuit{A^{\circ}}, [\Delta]\}}$	$5_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{\emptyset\}\{\diamondsuit{A}^{\circ}\}}{\Gamma\{\diamondsuit{A}^{\circ}\}\{\emptyset\}}$
$d_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{[A]\}}{\Gamma\{\Box A\}}$	$t_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{A\}}{\Gamma\{\Box A\}}$	$b_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{[\Delta], A\}}{\Gamma\{[\Delta, \Box A]\}}$	$4_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{[\Box A, \Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\Box A, [\Delta]\}}$	$5_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{\emptyset\}\{\Box A\}}{\Gamma\{\Box A\}\{\emptyset\}}$

Modal rules:

$d_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{[\langle P \rangle]\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \Diamond P \rangle\}}$	$t_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{\langle P \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \Diamond P \rangle\}}$	$b_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{[\Delta], \langle P \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{[\Delta, \langle \Diamond P \rangle]\}}$	$4_{R} \frac{\Gamma\{[\langle P \rangle, \Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\langle P \rangle, [\Delta]\}}$	$\frac{5_{R}}{\Gamma\{\langle \Diamond P \rangle\}} \frac{\Gamma\{\emptyset\}\{\langle \Diamond P \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \Diamond P \rangle\}\{\emptyset\}}$
$d_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{[\langle N\rangle]\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \Box N\rangle\}}$	$t_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{\langle N \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \Box N \rangle\}}$	$b_{L} \; \frac{\Gamma\{[\Delta], \langle N \rangle\}}{\Gamma\{[\Delta, \langle \Box N \rangle]\}}$	$4_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{[\langle \Box N \rangle, \Delta]\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \Box N \rangle, [\Delta]\}}$	$5_{L} \frac{\Gamma\{\emptyset\}\{\langle \Box N\rangle\}}{\Gamma\{\langle \Box N\rangle\}\{\emptyset\}}$

Depolarized sequent $[\Gamma]$: erase $\langle \rangle$, \uparrow , \downarrow

Soundness and completeness: NIK proves $\lfloor \Gamma \rfloor$ iff FoNIK proves Γ

Depolarized sequent $[\Gamma]$: erase $\langle \rangle$, \uparrow , \downarrow

Soundness and completeness: NIK proves $\lfloor \Gamma \rfloor$ iff FoNIK proves Γ Proof of completeness: every NIK rule is admissible in FoNIK

Depolarized sequent $[\Gamma]$: erase $\langle \rangle$, \uparrow , \downarrow

Soundness and completeness: NIK proves $\lfloor \Gamma \rfloor$ iff FoNIK proves Γ Proof of completeness: every NIK rule is admissible in FoNIK

simulation $NIK \longrightarrow FoNIK + cut$

Depolarized sequent $[\Gamma]$: erase $\langle \rangle$, \uparrow , \downarrow

Soundness and completeness: NIK proves $\lfloor \Gamma \rfloor$ iff FoNIK proves Γ Proof of completeness: every NIK rule is admissible in FoNIK

> simulation cut-elimination NIK \longrightarrow FoNIK + cut \longrightarrow FoNIK

Depolarized sequent $[\Gamma]$: erase $\langle \rangle$, \uparrow , \downarrow

Soundness and completeness: NIK proves $\lfloor \Gamma \rfloor$ iff FoNIK proves Γ **Proof of completeness:** every NIK rule is admissible in FoNIK

> simulation focused+nested cut-elimination NIK → FoNIK + cut → FoNIK

Depolarized sequent $[\Gamma]$: erase $\langle \rangle$, \uparrow , \downarrow

Soundness and completeness: NIK proves $[\Gamma]$ iff FoNIK proves Γ **Proof of completeness:** every NIK rule is admissible in FoNIK

> simulation focused+nested cut-elimination NIK → FoNIK + cut → FoNIK

 $FoNIK + cut \longrightarrow SyNIK + cut$

Depolarized sequent $[\Gamma]$: erase $\langle \rangle$, \uparrow , \downarrow

Soundness and completeness: NIK proves $[\Gamma]$ iff FoNIK proves Γ **Proof of completeness:** every NIK rule is admissible in FoNIK

> simulation focused+nested cut-elimination NIK → FoNIK + cut → FoNIK

Depolarized sequent $[\Gamma]$: erase $\langle \rangle$, \uparrow , \downarrow

Soundness and completeness: NIK proves $\lfloor \Gamma \rfloor$ iff FoNIK proves Γ

Proof of completeness: every NIK rule is admissible in FoNIK

simulation focused+nested cut-elimination NIK → FoNIK + cut → FoNIK

 $\begin{array}{ccc} \mathsf{FoNIK} + \mathsf{cut} & \longrightarrow & \mathsf{SyNIK} + \mathsf{cut} & \longrightarrow & \mathsf{SyNIK} & \longrightarrow & \mathsf{FoNIK} \\ & & & \mathsf{synthetic} \\ & & & \mathsf{cut-elimination} \end{array}$

About our quest:

- 1. structural proof systems (sequent style)
- 2. analytic (cut-free)
- 3. modular for a large class of modal logics
- 4. control of non-deterministic choices

About our quest:

- 1. structural proof systems (sequent style)
- 2. analytic (cut-free)
- 3. modular for a large class of modal logics
- 4. control of non-deterministic choices

Features of SyNIK:

About our quest:

- 1. structural proof systems (sequent style)
- 2. analytic (cut-free)
- 3. modular for a large class of modal logics
- 4. control of non-deterministic choices

Features of SyNIK:

Small: same number of rule as in the classical system

About our quest:

- 1. structural proof systems (sequent style)
- 2. analytic (cut-free)
- 3. modular for a large class of modal logics
- 4. control of non-deterministic choices

Features of SyNIK:

Small: same number of rule as in the classical system

Tidy:

$$\begin{bmatrix} \text{only structure} \\ \left\{ \left< \Delta \right> \right\} \\ \text{only logic} \\ \frac{\Gamma\left\{ \left< P \right> \right\}}{\Gamma\left\{ \uparrow P \right\}}$$